

With the emphasis in Extension on accountability this study offers a timely and appropriate insight to the benefits of a major leadership experience in 4-H. Although Extension educators and agricultural educators alike sing the praises of our programs, little has actually been done to document the success of our programs in the area of leadership development. The authors are to be commended for this work.

The conceptual and theoretical framework for this study provided several good insights into the situation being studied. The authors discussion of literature, concepts, and theories of leadership in the introduction could have been strengthened by including perspectives from outside of agriculture and Extension. What do others say about leadership development in youth? Are there similar or disparate opinions among psychologists, sociologists, leadership educators, and others?

The methods and procedures described were appropriate for this study.

The past council members seem to be doing quite well. How can you compare this group to others who may have been just as talented but were not selected to serve on the state council? Do you think that being 10-20 years removed from the experience had an impact on the recollection of how the experience influenced the respondents?

Less than 7% of these former state 4-H council members were involved in production agriculture. Is this a concern? About 21% of the former council members were involved as 4-H volunteers. Is this surprising?

This paper appears to have come from a larger study. Several of the conclusions appear to be unrelated to your objectives or findings.